

## **Holocaust and Other Genocide Subcommittee Meeting 3/24/22**

**Member Walker:** Good afternoon. It is 4:00 and I'd like to call this meeting to order. Roll taken. Senior Deputy Attorney General David Gardner was present for the record. Pledge of Allegiance recited.

**Member Walker:** The room is open for public comment. After the comment rules were read, public comment was open to Carson City and then Las Vegas. No public comments were given from Carson City. No public comment from Las Vegas. No written public comments.

**Member Walker:** Deputy Superintendent Todtman, did you want to welcome the committee?

**Deputy Superintendent Todtman:** Hi, I am Deputy Superintendent of Educator Effectiveness and Family Engagement here at the Nevada Department of Education. I know that Miss Malornie is going to go deeper into the purpose of our meeting today, but just to make sure we are all on the same page... Assembly Bill 231 out of the legislative session specifies the membership of this subcommittee and does not set any expectations on how the work will be conducted. It does set up our understanding that we are required as the State Board of Education to appoint a subcommittee to review and make recommendations on the matter in which to provide information to students concerning the Holocaust and Other Genocides. It further requires the subcommittee to review the manner in which academic standards support comprehensive education on the Holocaust as well as requires the State Board to submit a report to the legislature on or before October 1 of 2022 and even years going forward. We are pleased to have you all with us today. I want to ask each subcommittee member to introduce themselves. Please feel free as you do so to provide any additional context on your experience in related areas and interest in this work. So, I will pass it to member Miller.

**Member Miller:** Good afternoon everyone, I am Kelly Miller. I am currently a school administrator, Dean of students. This Fall I will be an Assistant Principal at a charter school here in Southern Nevada. I was a classroom teacher for 15 years- Theater and English Language Arts. I taught in Texas and Nevada. My experience with Holocaust and Other Genocides is experience in teaching, working with productions live, working with students grades 6-12, and the personal interests of our curriculum and what we are teaching our students from all grades, not just secondary but elementary as well.

**Member Asherian:** Hello everyone, I am Dr. Vartouhi Asherian. I currently work at the College of Southern Nevada in the Learning Office. My experiences in Genocides go back quite a while. I was the principal of an Armenian school in Orange County. I was instrumental in creating a genocide curriculum that accompanied Treasure Chest which I collected while working at the American University of Armenia. When we opened the University first. As a guest lecturer and student services administrator. During that time, I collected all the artifacts, brought it back, created the Treasure Chest curriculum, and it was implemented in the Orange County school system. I also was a K-12 Science and Math teacher in the past. In the last 20+ years, I have been in higher education. I am looking forward to working with everyone here and contributing as best as I can to this very important mission. Thank you.

**Member Brislin:** Hi everybody, my name is Jolie Brislin and I am the Nevada Regional Director of the Anti-Defamation League. We are happy to say that we were instrumental in the work on this bill with others on this call as well. If you are not familiar with the ADL, we are the leading anti-hate organization- fighting hate, bigotry, and antisemitism. We do this work in collaboration

with training on antisemitism, anti-bias, and Holocaust education. We have been working with CCSD for the past 15 years. I am happy to hear from others and different programs on this call to make it easier for the school districts to have access to those programs.

**Member Stites:** Good afternoon, my name is Nurit Stites. I am a second generation- meaning my parents are/were Holocaust survivors. I am around my 30th year of teaching in Nevada. I taught both in Clark County and currently in Washoe County. I have been a Holocaust educator since probably 2011-2012. I am one of the Northern Nevada educators for Holocaust educators, Governor's Advisory Council for Education related to the Holocaust. I am excited to do this incredible work that Nevada students and teachers deserve.

**Member Parsons:** I am a 3rd-year teacher. I currently teach Freshman and Sophomore English but I am certified to teach History, Art, and English. In May, I will be graduating with my Masters in Holocaust and Genocide Studies. I am blessed to be part of this group and I am excited to do work with you guys.

**Member Goss:** My name is Jennifer Goss and I am a program manager with Echoes and Reflections which is a joint partnership between the Anti-Defamation League, USC Shoah Foundation, and Yad Vashem. I just stepped out of the classroom after 19 years as a high school history teacher. I taught a Holocaust and Genocide studies elective. My dual MAs are in Holocaust and Genocide Studies and History. I also do a lot of work with other world genocides as a consultant to the USC Shoah Foundation.

**Member Kopalyan:** "Hello everybody, my name is Nerses Kopalyan, I am a professor of Political Science here at UNLV. My area of concentration is Political Violence. I've done a lot of work on ethnic cleansing and contemporary case studies of genocide. I do have a different perspective with connecting contemporary developments of political violence and genocide and tying it through historical precedent that is very important to educate the current generations. I am Armenian, both of my grandparents were survivors of the Armenian genocide. Aside from growing up with the whole historical tradition of fighting for recognition and social justice and historical justice I also have an academic background on the subject matter. It is my pleasure to be a part of this subcommittee

**Member Pohl:** My name is Kristin Pohl, I am currently a student advocate at Mac Middle School. I am returning to the classroom next year at Del Sol. I have been a teacher since 2006 and I certainly do not have the background that everyone here has, but I have worked with the Holocaust community for a long time. I teach everything except Math and Science. I've found a way to incorporate Holocaust studies into everything that I do. One reason I wanted to be part of this board is because I take kids on trips. I do a lot of traveling with kids. Before I was a student advocate, for 10 years I took about 50 kids a year to the LA Holocaust Museum, Museum of Tolerance, and other museums in Washington D.C., New York, and Boston. Currently, I am trying to put together a trip to Germany, Poland, and Prague. I am really interested to see where this is going and what the focus is going to be and really push this particular education in the classroom. I think it is not nearly seen as important as it is. Especially today, it is important.

**Member Fitch:** My name is Stephanie Fitch, this is my 29th year in education. I have taught a dedicated Holocaust class for 16 of those 18 years starting in 2005. I am excited to be on the committee. Thank you.

**Member Tusan:** I am Michelle Tusan. I am a professor of History at UNLV. I have been here for 21 years. I study, teach, and write about World War I and focus on humanitarianism and specifically about the Armenian Genocide. My last book was called the British Empire and the Armenian

Genocide. I am working on violence and World War I. I am looking at the long-term effects of genocide. I am excited to be part of this and I teach this in my classroom. My students and kids went through Clark County schools. My daughter is going through it now. I am happy to be here and thank you for this opportunity.

**Member Walker:** Hi, I am Elliot Malin, I am a lobbyist for the Anti-Defamation League. I worked with Jolie to pass this legislation. We worked tirelessly to make sure it was an all-encompassing bill. My great-grandparents came from Poland. Most of my family was killed in Auschwitz and Treblinka. So this is personal but also professional. I am excited to see this committee get off the ground. I look forward to accomplishing everything that we can and come back to Carson City with some good news.

**Member Miller:** I think that is everyone on my screen. Please speak up if I missed you. I will hand it back to Member Walker.

**Member Walker:** For the record, I am an appointed member of the state board of education representing school boards in Nevada. I am a current school trustee in Carson City. I am also an educator and principal of an elementary school in Dayton, Nevada.

**Member Walker:** The subcommittee will now elect a Chair Person and Vice-Chair Person for the subcommittee. Deputy Attorney General David Gardner will review the process. Deputy Gardner, please begin when you are ready.

**Deputy Attorney General David Gardner:** The way this process works is first we will do the Chair. Part of what the Chair will be doing is you will be dealing with the department in creating agendas. You will be meeting more than these public meetings that the subcommittee will have. You will have meetings in addition to that. You will be setting up the agenda. You will be also running the meetings and making sure meetings are in compliance. I will also be helping with that. Anyone who is a member can be Chair. Self-nominate, nominate someone else, and then we hold a vote. It is pretty basic and then whoever gets the highest amount of votes wins. We will do the exact same thing for Vice-Chair.

**Deputy Attorney General David Gardner:** Does anyone want to nominate themselves or someone else for Chair? Member Malin self-nominated. Anyone who is in favor of Elliot Malin to be the chair, please say aye.

**Group:** Aye.

**Deputy Attorney General David Gardner:** No nays. Congratulations, Chair Malin

**Deputy Attorney General David Gardner:** Now we will nominate and vote for Vice-Chair. Vice-Chair backs up and become the Chair if the Chair is not available. Any nominations or self-nominations?

**Member Goss:** I nominate Member Brislin.

**Deputy Attorney General David Gardner:** Any other nominations? None. All in favor please say aye.

**Group:** Aye.

**Deputy Attorney General David Gardner:** No nays. Congratulations Vice-Chair Brislin. I will hand it back over to Deputy Superintendent Todtman.

**Deputy Todtman:** It is important to us that members of the community and members of the committee step into those roles. The Department and the State Board are very invested in the work and we want to be there to support you. We wanted it to be led by the people who have come together to make this happen.

**Deputy Todtman:** I will move us on to Agenda item #5, to Miss Jayne Malorni who is an Educational Programs Professional in our Office of Standards and Instructional Support. She is one of the most talented and passionate people in the whole Department of Education to talk us through the legislation and what we have ahead of us.

**Jayne Malorni:** Thank you, Deputy Todtman. Hi, welcome, everybody. I am Jayne Malorni. You've received my emails, so thank you for being here. We are excited for this work to move on. Right now I am just going to review AB 231. I am sure a lot of you have it in front of you. We are just going to talk about our purpose. What we are doing in this subcommittee and what our role is so that we are really clear and move this work forward to what we want to accomplish. I am not going to go through each detail of the bill itself. If you do not have it I will make sure you receive it. Overall, what is that, and why we are here.

**Jayne Malorni:** So we are here to review and make recommendations to ensure that our students are receiving age-appropriate and historically accurate instruction when it comes to Holocaust and Other Genocides. When we say other genocides, we do mean to include Armenian, Cambodian, Darfur, Guatemalan, and Rwandan. In Social studies and Language Arts. So this is not just in one subject area. This crosses some areas because we do transfer skills. Our students need to know that what can be learned in one classroom can be learned in another classroom. I want to emphasize age-appropriate and historically accurate. Those are two big pieces for when we are reviewing curriculum, professional learning, and resources that we stick to. As part of our subcommittee's role, we will review and make recommendations in which we teach Holocaust and Other Genocides in Social Studies classrooms and Language Arts classrooms. We will look at resources that are available in all classrooms. Again, we want to ensure those resources are age-appropriate and historically accurate. Lastly, look at professional development. What professional learning is needed for teachers to assure that this instruction is occurring in the classroom? We currently have standards that our teachers must teach. We want to ensure that they have the best practice in order to teach that to our students. That really does rely on age appropriateness and historical accuracy. I keep saying that for a reason- those are our two major focus areas when we are evaluating and making recommendations on these areas.

**Jayne Malorni:** We are also going to be linking and looking at standards, particularly in Social Studies. The Language Arts standards themselves are the skills when we teach Social Studies. We want to ensure that we are linking what we are teaching to what this bill has outlined. Under section 3, it talks about "what actual areas that we need to ensure that we are linking in our standards?" and that we are providing instructional resources for our teachers to teach our kids and then professional learning if our teachers do need that. We want to be able to support our teachers. The last thing that we want to do is send our educators out into the classroom and talk about something that they do not feel comfortable with or do not have the support in order to do so. Some of these topics are very heavy, they are very mature, and we need to make sure that our teachers have that support behind them in order to teach that. When we say educators, I am not just talking about teachers. We are talking about administrators also. We are fortunate to have an administrator with us who can look from that perspective. The bill does allow for a lot of

ambiguity as far as what we are going to do and recommend. Our area of focus is: Are we teaching the standards? Do our teachers have the resources that are necessary? Are we partnering right with vendors and other organizations to help us teach using those resources as well as in professional learning? Those are our main goals. Any questions, comments, or thoughts?

**Member Brislin:** Can we get an outline of resources we are currently using or resources teachers and administrators have available?

**Jayne Malorni:** That can be something that the subcommittee does recommend. We can do a survey and see. Within Nevada, every district has the control/ability/right to choose what they want to teach. They do have to follow the standards that we mandate. What and how they use to teach and that is a decision of that local educational agency. We can ask to see what they are doing across the state in each district.

**Deputy Todtman:** I just want to say that we are joined here by our director, Dave Brancamp of our Office of Standards and Instructional Support. Jayne did a great job explaining the distinction between our oversight of standards versus curriculum versus instructional materials. Dave is also here on behalf of that team if any specific questions come up.

**Member Stites:** Am I understanding this correctly? Any kind of resources or support that we would like to implement or suggest must align with standards or are we writing standards for Holocaust and genocide education? Is that something the subcommittee is tasked with?

**Jayne Malorni:** Thank you member Stites. So we are tasked with currently looking at our standards and how we are aligning them to what is in the bill. It lines out specific tasks that we want to ensure instruction captures in the classroom. Our current task is to look at current standards in both Social Studies and ELA to ensure what we have is there. I am actually going to let Director Brancamp if there was a change or necessary need for a change in standards.

**Dave Brancamp:** Thank you Jayne, this is Dave Brancamp, I am the director of our office of Standards and Instructional Support in our Carson City office. If the committee felt there was a need or certain standards adjusted- that would be one of your recommendations. What it does is then brings the Social Studies standards or the ELA standards to the front. At this point, we would ask the Academic Standards Council permission to bring those standards back forth for possible revision. At this point, since you are in the room with our lead for Social Studies, Jayne Malorni would bring me the Social Studies team if that was where you deem the change should be together. We would have to have a reconvening of that committee that wrote those standards and possibly new members. And then run through the standards process. Just for the committee's sake here, that typically takes about a year to 18 months to make a standards adjustment. If it was on the ELA side it was transferred over to Darell Quernin. Dr Quernin is our ELA consultant and she would lead the changes if it was in the ELA side. Hopefully, that answers your question.

**Member Malin:** What would the fiscal impact be to rework the curriculum for the department or local governments? Or would there be one?

**Dave Brancamp:** The department can recommend curriculum sets but what we control are the standards. So because we are a local control state, Districts still have choice on the curriculum side. So from a fiscal side, it would be if they have material. You might present something that

has a cost to it- the districts would then be faced with how would they pay for that. From the standards and curriculum side, it's the cost of time. I know Member Stites was on our Social Studies committee- they are giving up their Saturdays or their evenings to help write these standards. There is no stipend at this point to pay them for that time. It's a volunteer process to work through the standards. So it is our staff's time and the committee member's time. In that 18-month period to approve, just so everyone is aware, once the standards are approved by our state board then the district still has a year to make changes to curriculum. It is a long process. We want things to get out quickly but it does take a fair amount of time to make those adjustments. For example, if we did not have something clear until June of 2023, the school districts would have the whole 2023-2024 school year to make changes to their curriculum. Jayne in her role would not expect to find a change in instruction until the 2024-2025 school year.

**Member Miller:** As a school administrator and a former ELA teacher I will be able to provide- I work with Academica Charter Schools- I will be able to provide most of us use the same curriculum base for ELA. I can provide the name and information for the entire committee. As well as if we are not using the same, what other ones are used. I will be able to provide that curriculum information for the committee.

**Jayne Malorni:** Chair Malin, did Director Brancamp answer your question?

**Member Malin:** Yes, thank you. I am trying to think of this in the concept of the legislative session and fiscal notes as well. When it comes to what we're trying to do. So I appreciate it. I'm sure I'll have more questions as we go along.

**Jayne Malorni:** I would like to also reiterate the fact when we look at how this bill was passed, we do want to ensure it does right- we want to link our current standards with community resources that can assist this instruction. So we do want to look at what we have and how we can better support our teachers with resources instruction and professional learning options for our educators. So we do want to think about what we do have because many districts are in fact right teaching Holocaust and Other Genocides. We just want to help them right? And make those recommendations on how we can either give them more of a vast amount of resources and professional learning than what they may have.

**Member Asherian:** Is there a time frame that we are looking at with completing this project?

**Deputy Superintendent Todtman:** So the legislation specifies that we owe a report to the legislative committee on Education by October 1 on each even year. Then the Legislative committee on education owes a report to the legislature on February 1 of each odd year. That does not mean we need to complete our work by October 1, but we need to have some written outcome of the work that we have done to date and potentially a plan for future work if we intend to keep working beyond that.

**Deputy Superintendent Todtman:** If there are no other questions, the good news about a first meeting agenda is that we keep it flexible to allow for conversation and digesting. So our next item, item #6 is discussion of action items. So we have already started hinting at one if we have other next steps we'd like to take or things we'd like to define, now would be the time. And then our next time, which I'm sure the DAG will lead into as we like is to discuss future agenda items. So if we are requesting presentation, someone wants to bring data, there's a specific tailored conversation you'd like to see at our next meeting, that would be a good item to discuss. As well

as any other ideas that you may wish to work on outside of our formal meetings. So we are subject to open meeting law. We do strive to do our work in public space but we are all a part of this committee because we contribute to this work in our daily lives in our own way. So if you would like to say, "I'm going to go away, I'm going to get this resource, I'm going to do this research, or I'm going to my school experience and bring in something, and then I want to bring that back to the committee." That would be an action item, right? So what personally you're going to do to bring back to the work or to contribute to the work. So now is a good time to keep having those conversations about what we intend to do next or where we think we would want to begin since there's an awful lot of potential work ahead and we want to make sure at the start.

**Member Tusan:** May I ask a question? Do we have a copy of those standards that you've been referencing? Are there uniform standards now or are they just now or are they just piecemeal? Because it certainly would be good to have a copy of what exists in the world and we could sort of start from there or do they not exist in the world? And are they all sort of local level? I'd sure like to see what exists out there first before we start tinkering.

**Jayne Malorni:** Thanks Member Tusan for the question. We do have standards, they are available currently. They were passed in 2018 and they were revised pretty drastically from the previous set that was done in 2008. So you are free to look at them right now. Chair if you are okay with that, I can email those standards to all the members. So you can have that PDF and you can look at that. Our standards are written in Social Studies for K-12. They cover topics and areas of History, Geography, Civics, Economics, Financial Literacy, and Multicultural education. So there's a lot. Our standards do go across grades K-12 with the expectation that those standards are taught in grades K-12. So these are the standards in which skill is embedded with content. So those are already there for you to be able to view and see. I will send that via email.

**Member Tusan:** Thank you.

**Member Stites:** Due to my work with Holocaust and genocide education and meeting many teachers who are clamoring for resources, support, and professional development in the area- I kind of like the idea of having a survey of what happens across our state regarding Holocaust and genocide education and where are teachers pulling these materials? We have two ADL people who are connected to ADL with vast materials and that could obviously support us. I am kind of wondering where our teachers are currently getting resources and what happens. What happens in local districts, charter schools, classrooms- what exactly is happening? I don't know if we can get a clear picture, but I am really interested in what is happening currently. I know member Parsons, we are from the same district so we know we are operating in a vacuum. Teachers are looking to us to provide materials and resources in professional development. This is something I do twice a year. So what's happening with these things. I know we have some college professors- are you supporting teachers professionals that are currently in the classroom, pre-professionals? Pre-service teachers and what is out there? It is very interesting to me. I do not know if this is a waste of our time or if some of you share my concern as what is out there. I won't tell you what I am thinking but is this something that the subcommittee feels like it is a good place to start- kind of a survey?

**Member Goss:** I would like to add two things. One, we also are partnered with the USC Shoah Foundation and Yad Vesham and also have good relationships with the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum. So we bring quite a depth of resources to the table through

Echoes and Reflections. I think what would be also interesting in addition to seeing what teachers are using is to really pull them on their level of comfort in the resources that they are using. This is also critical to being successful in our mission.

**Member Stites:** I've used Echoes and Reflections. I've used ADL materials, Facing History, and Yad Vesham. I've used a ton of resources. I am just not sure that others like me are able to pull. Those of us that have been in the classroom know that it isn't easy to go and start researching appropriate materials. My skin crawls when I hear people/teachers/colleagues using Boy In The Striped Pajamas to teach Holocaust. That's concerning to me, you know. And it seems like well, "but that's all I have" and I have Night and that's kind of where it starts and it ends. I am just interested. The colleagues that come to me are the same 40-70 teachers who constantly want professional development, materials, and resources to take back to their classrooms. It doesn't seem like it comes from an entity. It comes from a personal interest. That's the best way I can say that. It comes from personal interest or perhaps the feeling of moral responsibility of individual teachers. That's what it comes from. So what are the rest doing?

**Member Brislin:** I am happy to work with anyone on this survey because I think we need to get an idea. Are they teaching and addressing the Armenian genocide and other genocides? So they know where to get that information as well. I mean, we are all here together. I wouldn't say that I'm the master of what we need, but I don't think we have a full understanding, breadth, or depth of how any of the school districts are addressing the Holocaust and genocide. What I would love to see from this committee is ultimately be able to put something together where it's easily accessible for school districts to know where all this information lives so that they are able to continue to update their own comfort and continue to learn and pull information with lesson plans for their students.

**Member Asherian:** I kind of agree that surveys- we need a benchmark somewhere to get the ball rolling here. But I also want to talk about- as Member Malornie mentioned earlier- we need to include their administrators to understand what are they doing to support and are they away of what genocides or Holocaust information that's being shared/taught in classrooms. Again, I think it was mentioned. It's important to know what genocides are being mentioned. My daughter is in school and Armenian genocide was never in the history classrooms throughout her high school. To me, we need to understand, do they know what all these genocides are? Should we make a list? Again, it comes down to building a benchmark for ourselves to see where they are and tying that to what the standards are and creating that pipeline of support materials or other links to go to for assistance or support. I concur and I'll be happy to work on a survey to move this along.

**Member Malin:** Really fast, I agree with all of that. I have more of a technical question on technology. Can you see it in Vegas when we raise our hands on the system? Because Member Tusan, I saw that you had your hand up. But I do agree with all of that. Thank you.

**Deputy Superintendent Todtman:** If I were logged into Life Size on my computer, I could see it, but since I am not, I cannot see it. So Chair Malin, I designate you to call on anyone with their hands up who's on remotely or certainly I did catch Member Stites up before visibly. We can see each of you on the screen but I know not everyone is on video currently.

**Member Malin:** Thank you, I don't know Member Tusan if you had something you wanted to say. Otherwise, I know that Member Goss has her hand up. This was an error. I know that Member Pohl has her hand up as well.



**Member Pohl:** I've taught all the way across the curriculum in Social Studies. One of the things that I've struggled with most especially next year I'm going to struggle with because I am going to into being Psychology teacher. Finding curriculum for Psychology and Sociology is very difficult. It obviously needs to be heavily history-based when we're talking also about the Holocaust and genocides, we also want to talk about recognizing and upcoming or how kids can recognize as it comes towards them, not just the history of it. Oftentimes that's a place where psychology and sociology can play a big part. So I'd really like to see if we're going to talk about curriculum, Psychology and Sociology often become the "island of misfit toys" because we don't fit into science and we kind of get left alone by social studies. And so when it comes to curriculum for those two things it's very difficult to find it and because I have a great interest in the subject matter I find a way especially things like bystander issues and stuff like that in psychology, I find a way to fit it in but finding curriculum on that it is almost impossible.

**Member Malin:** Yeah that's actually a really interesting point too on the way we diversify the education through different lines.

**Member Parsons:** I wanted to go off on what member Pohl was stating. I am in the same focus as you as I was really drawn to the Sociological Psychological aspect of genocide because I mean genocide can happen. I can actually bring- I just wrote a curriculum that I will be bringing to Germany Ranch high school next year. That covers English standards as well as Social Studies standards. It's specifically this is not on the Holocaust and other genocides. I start off with the entire class with a huge focus on Sociology and Psychology because that's what I'm currently writing my thesis on. I am happy to share that with the group as well if it would be beneficial.

**Member Goss:** I will also add in that we have a variety of different not only curriculum approaches but also trainings for educators that address those areas from a civics perspective from a Psychology Sociology perspective as well as ELA then of course, more standard histories across the organizations that we work with. So we'll be happy to fill in the gaps that we see as we work as well as work within our networks to bring resources to you.

**Member Pohl:** Yeah, I think that becomes super important because when you're a teacher in the classroom, finding those pipelines of the information is the most difficult thing. You almost always spend your entire time hunting down things that you can create for yourself in your classroom rather than we used to have the luxury of Holocaust survivors coming in and start that interest but of course that's going away because there aren't very many of them that speak anymore. So trying to find that actual pipeline when you want to put it into your curriculum, just the initial step is very difficult.

**Dave Brancamp:** I know you're sharing some wonderful ideas, we just have to remember our charge from the department side as well as around the standards and the standards in Social Studies as Jayne Malorni listed out are what we are held by interest. So legally, what we must put in. I understand the concern to Psychology and so on, but those do not fit under the department even as a set of standards. So we would be in violation with the districts on some of those. So we can offer that as a suggestion to Jayne. But it would be something that as you build your agenda going forth, we really need to focus on where those fit our current standards as the way the bill was written and where we are charged from the department is around how we are supporting these given standards as they were in law written. So if we branch outside that we start to play right on that fringe area that we have to be cautious of where we are. So

Jayne Malorni, if you want to add anymore- since it's in her subject area of expertise but that is the bounds of which I need to watch where we are playing.

**Jayne Malorni:** Thanks Dave. I would just say that we need to- in Social Studies itself, you can call it Social Studies and there has been the argument first between Social Studies and the Social Sciences and I think what Member Pohl is alluding to is that aspect of Psychology and Sociology which are considered Social Studies electives but they are not considered core classes where we have standards that support that. Most I would say classrooms who do teach Sociology, Psychology, Anthropology use the national standards or some nation forums that have standards to teach those classes. Something that the subcommittee can do recommendations is to provide resources that may help with those curriculum aspects that Member Pohl was talking about. We could say, this is a possibility of a strong resources to use so that we can give time back to teachers. Which is something that we do want to do- is ensure that our teachers are given resources that are going to be anchored in critical thinking and rigorous and that we're giving them resources. That is something that will help our teachers teach what is being taught in the classroom. We can provide those recommendations and suggestions but they are not standard-based because we do not have standards from a state perspective in those courses.

**Member Asherian:** I want to look ahead a little bit and suggest as we are doing this work to start building the support site which will encompass these materials. One-stop-shop kind of for the teachers because if I was a teacher in a classroom and I needed to teach this material- I would love to have a website. I can go to where there's a list of survivors if they're still available or contact people who are the experts who are willing to contribute to education as guest speakers or what have you. Have the documents or materials available. Images, collection of images, books, etc. So I'm kind of foreseeing us to have this elaborate repository of information that I would love as a teacher to have a One-stop-shop location to go to and say okay here are the things I would like to pull and go to the classroom prepared with these materials. This maybe more futuristic but I do want to think about how we're going to present these materials or have those available for teachers. Someone earlier mentioned about teacher pipeline preparation. I think member Stites was mentioning something like that. I work at an educator at an adjunct in the Education department and I teach education courses. Unfortunately, to my knowledge at the College of Southern Nevada where we give an education degree for students. We do not have anything that prepares them or even remotely helps them understand the closest multicultural education that we bring to the students. That does not cover what we're talking about here. So I just want to make that comment that maybe that's another recommendation we can bring into the education courses to have a unit that helps them understand the gravity of this topic and help them engage in some ways that they can take away with them and teaching these subject matters to students. So again, that could be another avenue or recommendation that we can have.

**Member Miller:** As a classroom teacher, I had to teach units on the Holocaust. Based on the provided curriculum, having had that theatrical background and having been on stage and in the Arts for 15 years prior and exposed to not just Holocaust but all sorts of genocides and to make sure that it's age-appropriate depending on where you are. There may be a battle there to make sure that it's historically accurate as you were stating earlier. There is that divisional line. I have worked in Nevada and Michigan. I am originally from Texas. I do know that in our state, I have not seen that issue. There are those issues with administrators not having the full understanding

or they themselves. I also like to remind teachers of this as well- parents and community members, that if the administrator or teacher themselves were not taught it their comfort level may be low because they do not have the information. They themselves may not be well educated in a certain area. So it is provided that teacher/educator those resources. The information themselves again in professional development just so that there's a comfort level that they're understanding. Often we hear just about the Holocaust. So Armenian genocide, Cambodian, Rwandan, right? All these different genocides throughout the world. So I can say, from a personal point, it was myself having to go and search, even as an educator at my 15th year. I had to go myself and research for information beyond Boy in the Striped Pajamas and Night. Although those are wonderful novels and historically somewhat accurate in some ways and greatly taught- we do have to provide them resources. That's why we should provide the education because maybe that is the only education they themselves know.

**Member Stites:** I agree with you and I think the issues is- I have a background in theater arts and I've been an administrator as well as part of different schools, communities, and environments. I'm going to go back to my first point. I think that we need a survey of what's out there. What do people know and what we currently have.

**Member Tusan:** Another thing to add to this is why reinvent the wheel. I know California has standards and they have a system at least with and I don't know if they are doing what we're doing, which is really creating a broad understanding of genocide. I know they have them for the Armenian genocide and Holocaust. I wonder if we can use models. The idea of a website is wonderful but someone has to maintain that. The idea of a speaker list is wonderful but someone has to maintain that and it can be a labor of love certainly but you would hate to have a resource that was independently maintained and fell out of usefulness because the person that did it just had other interested or there was more up to date stuff. So think there has to be a way to institutionalize this and create a set of resources that are going to be available, lasting, and vetted to get back to the point of being age-appropriate and historically accurate. I think that's a heavy burden but we are not the first to have done this. So I don't have that information. I just know that these standards exist in other places so it might be interesting to see what was produced out of state curriculums that have done this before in addition to the survey. So then when we're adjusting standards and looking for resources we have vetted materials that will be stable and long-lasting.

**Member Parsons:** I just wanted to add to remember Tusan's comment about maintaining the website. I know that the Social Studies department for Washoe County, they have a website that they use. I am not sure who runs that. I am happy to find out who maintains it and does all the information. Basically, it's like every single teacher uploads their stuff to this website. I'm not exactly sure how it works but I used it pretty frequently during my internship and during my first year of teaching when I was doing History instead of English. I am happy to get that information because it's super beneficial to have, but you're right it does need to be a maintained website or else there's no point in having it if it falls through the cracks and becomes outdated.

**Member Malin:** That's a good point. I have a quick technical question for DAG Gardner. What is the number that we have that I can have in communication to not violate open meeting law? Because I know we don't have all members on right now. Do you happen to know what it is?

**Deputy Attorney General David Gardner:** Are you talking about communications outside of this meeting or in this meeting.

**Member Malin:** Outside of this meeting. Specifically, say I want to work outside of the meeting to get the survey together and members want to work together on that survey. What's that number of the limit.

**Deputy Attorney General David Gardner:** That would be 5. There are 11 members on the board as far as I remember. So it would be under what it takes to have a quorum which is six. So five can meet and discuss anything you guys want to talk about. As long as those five don't then go talk to somebody else which means over a quorum would have discussed it. So as long as you make sure those five don't talk to anybody else then you're fine.

**Member Malin:** Perfect, yeah I just want to make sure we don't violate Nevada open meeting law because I hear that there's at least one thing that's actionable that we can start working on and that is the survey. So if who is interested in that, that would be wonderful.

Those interested in helping with the survey: Member Stites, Member Parsons, Member Asherian, and Member Miller.

**Member Todtman:** DAG Gardner knows I spend a lot of time working and laboring in workgroups of subcommittees of committees. Something that's really important to us in the spirit and intention of open meeting law is that if regardless of how many people are there you can have two people, you can have five people- you should not be deliberating and making decisions on behalf of the group, right? So if we're going to move- like the survey is going to come back to the full group, we're all going to talk about it so all of our stakeholders can see so that's really important. Also the spirit of the conversation, it should truly be a working conversation. You shouldn't be taking action on behalf of the group without discussing it here.

**Member Malin:** Absolutely. I think that coming together and bringing ideas for a final survey where we can have a final discussion to publish for our next meeting might be something that we can do now that's actionable. So we can start moving into a productive path. So I agree, we don't definitely want to violate Nevada open meeting law.

**Member Brislin:** So how many people do we have working on the survey?

**Member Malin:** I have Member Asherian, Miller, Stites, and Parsons. Jolie, if you want to do it too, that would keep us. But yeah, we just have to remind ourselves that we are talking about what is potential. It's not a final decision. We're just bringing everything to the table so we can start working as a complete group.

**Jayne Malorni:** I just want to recap about things I heard as far as actions and then maybe potential future agenda items. Please let me know if I miss something or we need to add something. Action items would be essentially standards. I will be emailing standards to all of the subcommittee members. Two, the survey. So those would be the two action items that we can do right away. Future items then for that would cause for future and continuing conversation would be building or having a repository of sites someplace where we can have materials. There are some things that we can do with that. Then also I heard for future conversations about teacher prep programs. I just wanted to capture what we have discussed so that we kind of see where we're going. If there's something I have missed or if there is something we need to highlight, please let us know.

**Member Malin:** I think that is good. I appreciate you taking those notes and helping with that. Really fast, before I forget, Stephanie, I saw that you had your hand up as well.

**Member Fitch:** I was wondering if it might be wise at this point for those of us on the subcommittee to start gathering list of our resources. I know after teaching the class for 16 years I have file cabinets filled with them. I'd be happy to start collecting resources on the subcommittee have used in the past so we can start creating a resource list. So I am thinking, a list of books that I have found very helpful in preparing to teach Holocaust perhaps some handouts, websites, or lessons. All of these things. We can start pulling together in anticipation of people who need support as Member Parsons has talked about a website. Savannah, talk to Teaching American History Project. They might still have their site going. Anyway, I would be happy to start if people email me their suggestions on resources, websites, books, lessons, ect. I can start organizing that.

**Member Stites:** I have a cautionary tale with that and that would be the vetting. The vetting issues of it. If I'm going to start providing what I've used and you're going to provide what you've used, granted, we know that we're teaching in a vacuum as far as that's concerned. I'm not saying I have an opposition to that, I'm here to support educators. So that's my only issue- I see us also as kind of a vetting body where I think we need to decide what we're putting in front. I think that it might be a little bit in the future as well- to look at some resources. I would like to add to Jayne- I'd like to add to the future list what Member Tusan discussed perhaps looking at just an example- the state of California standards for genocide and Holocaust. See what we can adapt from them because the work has been done. There are plenty of states that have done really robust and incredible work where that's concerned. I would caution against using this subcommittee as "here's a resource, here's a speaker, here's an expert" simply because I think we need to see, first what we do have, what we don't and discuss very deeply suggestions and vet those resources before giving them out to teachers. So I'd like to add to the action items perhaps looking at what other state programs and standards are out there. I second Member Tusan and I would like to add that to our future list.

**Member Fitch:** Member Stites, if I may, I think you have an excellent idea with the vetting. Let me clarify, if we pull these lists of resources together that could be something this subcommittee does is look at all those resources and say, "Yeah, we agree with this or more of this needs more discussion". Certainly, I was not intending that we would share that list without of course going over it carefully.

**Member Stites:** Yeah, that's exactly the process I'd like to engage in when we get there.

**Member Tusan:** I just wanted to add this conversation about vetting. Because genocide is a topic that is denied by classrooms and because there is so much denial of genocide that a website or a source- even we are not experts in this room on every genocide. I would really caution putting up materials about genocide because it could undermine the whole project. If you find one thing on that list that doesn't look right, that someone questions, you get on a list and you end up in a firestorm. I really think we need to trust experts on this and people who very much can be verifiable experts who know about these genocides. I've taught many different comparative genocides, but I would certainly not consider myself an expert in all genocides. So even though I've been trained, my level of expertise is quite narrow. I think we have to not overstep our charge and think we could do an incredible amount of good by creating standards that are accessible, doable, or actionable. That teacher training piece is important. A few years back, UNLV did a big panel discussion about displacement, Holocaust, and genocide. The room was packed and I couldn't figure out why it was so packed. The organizer said it's because teachers are getting credit for it to further their education. So I would feel much more

comfortable putting our resources towards teacher training in these kinds of events than putting up a website because even as well-intentioned as we can be, I think you risk undermining the entire project if something goes up that doesn't quite... and we've even had a disagreement in this room about what could be taught and cannot be taught, right? I would just be against us becoming experts in the field and rather be guides in how we can get this taught through using the right expertise and equipping teachers with good materials by experts that have been vetted.

**Member Malin:** I think that's a really good point. Can we get another recap of all the things for future agenda items really fast, please?

**Jayne Malornie:** I'm happy to do that. So action steps really are delivering of standards to members and the survey construction. The survey really was about resources, level of comfort, and then using that as a benchmark. This will help us gauge what genocides are being mentioned and taught in the classroom. For future items, it was the idea of a repository, teacher prep programs, looking at other state standards and resources, and ensuring our teachers are receiving professional learning and these aspects equipping them with the tools they need to teach the standards and teach what's in front of them relating to Holocaust and other genocides.

**Member Malin:** Perfect, I appreciate that. I think that's a really good start. Does anyone else have anything they would like to add to future agendas? I'm seeing nothing and I think you guys still have the script down there.

**Superintendent Todtman:** Thank you Chair. On behalf of Member Walker, I'll take us through the end of the agenda because I have a script too. Agenda item #8, public comment #2 is for non agenda items within the subcommittee's jurisdiction. Public comment may be submitted to email at [nvboarded@doe.gov](mailto:nvboarded@doe.gov) or the public may attend in person to provide public comment. I am not going to go through the instructions because I don't think they're relevant so I can say there is no public comment in Las Vegas. How about in Carson City?

**Carson City:** No in person public comment in Carson at this time.

Superintendent Todtman: Has the secretary received any written submissions?

**Carson City:** No, I have not.

**Superintendent Todtman:** Thank you Dylan, thanks for all your help today and than you everyone for your time, commitment, passion, and experience. We're really excited to bring this work forward. I hope that you and your families are staying safe and healthy. If there are no other questions, this meeting is adjourned at 5:26 PM. Have a great evening.